

We want to prove that  $\mathcal{I} = \langle U, \cdot^{\mathcal{I}} \rangle$  is a model of

$$\varphi = \forall x \exists y ((f(x) = c) \rightarrow P(x, y))$$

with

$$\begin{aligned} U &= \{u_1, u_2\} \\ c^{\mathcal{I}} &= u_1 \\ f^{\mathcal{I}} &= \{u_1 \mapsto u_2, u_2 \mapsto u_1\} \\ P^{\mathcal{I}} &= \{(u_2, u_2)\} \end{aligned}$$

*Proof:* Consider any variable assignment  $\alpha$ . We first look at  $\alpha_1 = \alpha[x := u_1][y := u_2]$ .

Because  $c^{\mathcal{I}} = u_1$  and  $f(x)^{\mathcal{I}, \alpha_1} = f^{\mathcal{I}}(\alpha_1(x)) = f^{\mathcal{I}}(u_1) = u_2 \neq u_1 = c^{\mathcal{I}}$ , we have

$$\mathcal{I}, \alpha_1 \not\models (f(x) = c) \text{ or } \mathcal{I}, \alpha_1 \models \neg(f(x) = c).$$

so we also know that

$$\mathcal{I}, \alpha_1 \models (\neg(f(x) = c) \vee P(x, y)) \text{ which means } \mathcal{I}, \alpha_1 \models ((f(x) = c) \rightarrow P(x, y)).$$

Since there is a  $u \in U$  (namely  $u_2$ ) such that  $\mathcal{I}, \alpha[x := u_1][y := u] \models ((f(x) = c) \rightarrow P(x, y))$  we can use the definition of  $\models$  for existentially quantified formulas to derive

$$\mathcal{I}, \alpha[x := u_1] \models \exists y ((f(x) = c) \rightarrow P(x, y)) \quad (*)$$

We now look at  $\alpha_2 = \alpha[x := u_2][y := u_2]$ . Because  $(\alpha_2(x), \alpha_2(y)) = (u_2, u_2) \in P^{\mathcal{I}}$ , we know that  $\mathcal{I}, \alpha_2 \models P(x, y)$  and (with the same reasoning as above), we conclude that

$$\mathcal{I}, \alpha_2 \models ((f(x) = c) \rightarrow P(x, y)).$$

Since there is one  $u \in U$  (namely  $u_2$ ) such that  $\mathcal{I}, \alpha[x := u_2][y := u] \models ((f(x) = c) \rightarrow P(x, y))$  we can use the definition of  $\models$  for existentially quantified formulas to derive

$$\mathcal{I}, \alpha[x := u_2] \models \exists y ((f(x) = c) \rightarrow P(x, y)) \quad (**)$$

We have shown (in  $(*)$  and  $(**)$ ) that  $\mathcal{I}, \alpha[x := u] \models \exists y ((f(x) = c) \rightarrow P(x, y))$  holds for all  $u \in U$ , so we have

$$\mathcal{I}, \alpha \models \forall x \exists y ((f(x) = c) \rightarrow P(x, y))$$

which is what we wanted to show ( $\mathcal{I}, \alpha \models \varphi$  for all variable assignments  $\alpha$ ).